

Child Sexual Abuse Allegations in Custody Cases

A Bibliography



June 2016

***Local Service.
Global Leadership.***



**National Children's
Advocacy Center**

210 Pratt Avenue, Huntsville, AL 35801
256-533-(KIDS) 5437 • nationalcac.org



© 2010, 2014, 2016 National Children’s Advocacy Center. All rights reserved.

Preferred citation: National Children’s Advocacy Center. (2016). *Child Sexual Abuse Allegations in Custody Cases: A Bibliography*. Huntsville, AL: Author.

This project was supported by a grant awarded by the Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, Office of Justice Programs, U.S. Department of Justice. Points of view or opinions in this document are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the official position or policies of the U.S. Department of Justice.

Scope

This bibliography covers a variety of issues related to allegations of child sexual abuse in custody cases. Publications include books and journal articles published in English, 1986-2012. This bibliography is not comprehensive.

Organization

This bibliography lists publications in date descending order from 1986-2016. When possible, the abstracts that were included with the original publication are used in this bibliography.

Disclaimer

This bibliography was prepared by the Digital Information Librarian of the National Children's Advocacy Center (NCAC) for the purpose of research and education, and for the convenience of our readers. The NCAC is not responsible for the availability or content of cited resources. The NCAC does not endorse, warrant or guarantee the information, products, or services described or offered by the authors or organizations whose publications are cited in this bibliography. The NCAC does not warrant or assume any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed in documents cited here. Points of view presented in cited resources are those of the authors, and do not necessarily coincide with those of the National Children's Advocacy Center.

Child Sexual Abuse Allegations in Custody Cases

A Bibliography

The American Professional Society on the Abuse of Children (2016). APSAC position paper on allegations of child maltreatment and intimate partner violence in divorce/parental relationship dissolution. Chicago, IL: Author.

Smit, A. E., Antokolskaia, M. V., & Bijleveld, C. C. (2015). [Between scylla and charybdis: A literature review of sexual abuse allegations in divorce proceedings](#). *Psychology*, 6(11),1373-1384.

In this study international literature is reviewed on allegations of child sexual abuse (CSA) during divorce proceedings. It aims to build upon the existing knowledge on this topic by combining empirical findings from various disciplines. We attempted to answer four research questions that focus on 1) the prevalence of CSA allegations in divorce procedures; 2) the response of family court judges; 3) the ratio of founded vs. unfounded allegations of CSA under these circumstances; and 4) the possible consequences of the false positives and false negatives in legal decision making for the children and parents involved. The literature study shows that civil judges often seek professional help. The judge generally tends to (temporarily) stop contact between accused parent and child during an investigation. Additionally, there is a general concern about the many actors involved in such cases. It can also be cautiously assumed that one in seven to eight allegations is not founded. We conclude that civil judges have to make important decisions under difficult circumstances: there is little or no evidence, no guidelines, external help lengthens the trial, and there are serious consequences of false positives and false negatives in legal decision-making. Literature is surprisingly scarce and generally outdated.

MacKay, T. (2014). False allegations of child abuse in contested family law cases: The implications for psychological practice. *Educational & Child Psychology*, 31(3), 85-96.

Educational psychologists are working increasingly with children who are not only from families where there has been divorce or separation but who are also the subject of contested family law cases. This study investigates 107 children from 72 families in which residence issues had been

previously settled but which were subject to ongoing disputes regarding contact or change of residence. Such cases are marked in general by allegations and counter-allegations of each parent in regard to the historical or current conduct of the other. This study considers the frequency of allegations of child physical or sexual abuse in cases of this kind, with a particular focus on false allegations. It also notes the high prevalence of mental health problems among the children involved in the disputes. Implications for educational psychology practice are examined.

Kuehnle, K., & Drozd, L. (Eds). (2013). *Child custody litigation: Allegations of child sexual abuse*. Routledge.

Child Custody Litigation: Allegations of Child Sexual Abuse is an invaluable resource for forensic mental health professionals involved with conducting custody evaluations in family court proceedings. Each of the book's five chapters reviews an important component of the evaluation process when allegations of child sexual abuse have been made, moving beyond the description of each parent's psychological functioning and parenting capacity, the identity and needs of the child, and the parent's ability to meet those needs. The book's contributors examine the organizational structure of a child custody evaluation, the meanings of sexual behaviors demonstrated by children, descriptions of sex offenders assessment instruments, the usefulness of Rorschach examinations, and observations from presiding judges.

O'Donohue, W., Benuto, L. T., Fondren, R. N., Tolle, L., Vijay, A., & Fanetti, M. (2013). Dimensions of child sexual abuse allegations: What is unusual and what is not?. *Journal of Forensic Psychology Practice*, 13(5), 456-475.

Summit claimed via his child sexual abuse accommodation syndrome (CSAAS) that children often (a) recant; (b) make disclosures that are unconvincing (i.e., "illogical" and "incredible"); (c) make contradictory claims; and (d) make delayed claims. In this study, 97 substantiated cases of child sexual abuse were examined for both the key properties outlined by Summit and also for other key properties that have been discussed by experts. Results indicate that some of the key properties of CSASS (recantation and contradictions) are rare in substantiated cases. While delayed claims were common, the delays in this sample were generally shorter than proposed in

CSAAS. Results also revealed that allegations rarely contained logistical implausibilities, impoverished details, a stake factor, strange elements in the context of the outcry, fantastical details, or reports of repressed memories.

Lowenstein, L. F. (2012). Child contact disputes between parents and allegations of sex abuse: What does the research say? *Journal of Divorce & Remarriage*, 53(3), 194-203.

This article is written by a psychologist practicing in the area of clinical and forensic psychology. He has written widely in the area of child sex abuse, including a book entitled Paedophilia. He has dealt with many cases of parental alienation where sex abuse by one parent has been alleged. The object of this article is to try to provide a way of clarifying whether or not sexual abuse has occurred between an adult and a child, especially when implacable hostility exists between the parents who have parted. It is at such times that many custodial parents make allegations of sexual abuse against a now-absent parent, usually the father, to prevent access. It is important to protect children from actual sex abuse when it has occurred and to prevent this from reoccurring. It is, however, equally important not to allow false sexual allegations against a former partner who might have done nothing wrong but carried out his role as a caring and loving parent. The appendices of the article consist of an inventory that can be used by practitioners to differentiate true from false sex abuse allegations especially in relation to parental alienation conflicts. [Publisher Abstract]

Saini, M., Black, T., Lwin, K., Marshall, A., Fallon, B., & Goodman, D. (2012). Child protection workers' experiences of working with high-conflict separating families. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 34(7), 1309-1316.

Ongoing acrimonious conflict between separating parents can challenge child protection workers charged with the responsibility of investigating repeated allegations, especially when parents vigorously deflect blame to the other parent. There remains little evidence, however to guide practice when working with high-conflict families. The aim of this grounded theory approach was to explore child protection workers' perspectives of working with high-conflict families. Four focus groups with 28 child protection workers were conducted in a large metropolitan agency. Findings revealed an overall lack of consensus regarding the definition of high-conflict families.

Participants expressed being challenged by the lack of training and experience to work with disputing parents involved in high-conflict. Participants also expressed that these cases require a substantial amount of resources, time, energy and emotional fortitude to deal with competing allegations of child maltreatment, the manipulation of acrimonious parents and the pressures of the family law system to take positions regarding custody and access issues. The study offers greater awareness of the challenges and opportunities of helping children who are caught between their parents' child custody disputes within the context of child protection services.

Nichols, K. S. (2009). Assessing sexual abuse protocols for family litigation. *American Journal of Family Law*, 22(4), 184-191.

This article addresses what, if any, psychotherapeutic interventions should be provided to meet the emotional and clinical needs of alleged child victims of sexual abuse while they await judicial determinations from the family, dependency, or criminal courts. The discussion emphasizes that to minimize iatrogenic outcomes, professionals involved in sexual abuse allegation cases should carefully establish and maintain professional role boundaries and take on only one role in a case. Professional roles may include an investigative forensic interviewer, court appointed forensic evaluator, and therapist. Special attention is given to complex issues that arise in child custody cases with allegations of child sexual abuse in family court. [Author Abstract]

Bala, N., Mitnick, M. Trocme, N., & Houston, C. (2007). Sexual abuse allegations and parental separation: Smokescreen or fire? (Report). *Journal of Family Studies*, 13(1), 26-56.

If allegations of sexual abuse of a child are made after parents separate, the challenges of resolving custody and visitation issues are greatly increased, with the abuse allegations overshadowing other considerations. These are high conflict cases, anti-settlement may be very difficult (or inappropriate) to arrange. The involvement of a number of agencies and professionals, with overlapping responsibilities and potentially conflicting opinions, may complicate the resolution of these cases. A significant proportion of allegations of child abuse made in the context of parental separation are true, but this is a context with a relatively high rate of unfounded allegations. While some cases of untrue allegations are due to fabrication, more commonly unfounded allegations are

made in good faith. Preexisting distrust or hostility may result in misunderstandings and unfounded allegations, especially in cases where the children involved are young and the allegations are reported through a parent. Some cases of unfounded allegations may be the product of the emotional disturbance of the accusing parent. This paper discusses how parental separation affects the making of child sexual abuse allegations, with particular emphasis on how separation may contribute to unfounded allegations. Recent research is reviewed, and national data from Canada on allegations of abuse and neglect when parents have separated is presented. Legal issues that arise in these cases are discussed in the context of American and Canadian case law. The authors discuss factors that can help distinguish founded from unfounded cases. The paper concludes by offering some practical advice about the handling of this type of case by mental health professional, judges, and lawyers.

Behnke, D. K., & Connell, M. (2005). Child custody evaluations in cases involving sexual abuse: A view from the bench. *Journal of Child Custody*, 2(3), 121-136.

Psychological evaluation and testimony play a critical role in child sexual abuse cases, especially in custody and visitation cases. While the evaluation generally cannot determine whether sexual abuse has occurred, it can provide useful information to assist the court in deciding matters of custody and access in the face of the allegations. Judges need to know the standard of practice for the development of expert opinion in order to be able to evaluate testimony offered by custody evaluators. The informed judge can develop useful input by outlining expectations within the order for evaluation and actively regulating the gate for admission of expert testimony. Elements of a model order for custody evaluations addressing allegations of sexual abuse are proposed.

Johnson, T. C. (2005). Young children's problematic sexual behaviors, unsubstantiated allegations of child abuse, and family boundaries in child custody disputes. *Journal of Child Custody*, 2(4), 111-26.

Allegations of child sexual abuse are sometimes alleged based on a child's problematic sexual behaviors. When the allegations are unsubstantiated, child custody evaluators are asked to make recommendations regarding custody. Historically, it has been believed that if a child engages in

problematic sexual behaviors it is strong evidence of child sexual abuse. Recent research finds that there are many reasons, other than overt sexual abuse, for children to engage in problematic sexual behaviors. This article outlines these reasons and provides a methodology for the evaluation of the boundaries in both parents' homes to assist in determining the possible etiology of the problematic sexual behaviors of the child. Suggestions are made regarding visitation and reunification if boundary concerns are found.

Johnston, J. R., Lee, S., Olesen, N. W., & Walters, M. G. (2005). Allegations and substantiations of abuse in custody-disputing families. *Family Court Review*, 43(2), 283-294.

In this study of 120 divorced families referred for child custody evaluations and custody counseling, multiple allegations of child abuse, neglect, and family violence were raised in the majority of cases. About half of the alleged abuse was substantiated in some way with one fourth involving abuse perpetrated by both parents. Different kinds of allegations were raised against mothers compared with fathers. Implications of these findings for social policy, family court interventions, and the provision of coordinated services within the community are discussed.

Trocmé, N., & Bala, N. (2005). False allegations of abuse and neglect when parents separate. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, 29(12), 1333-1345.

The 1998 Canadian Incidence Study of Reported Child Abuse and Neglect (CIS-98) is the first national study to document the rate of intentionally false allegations of abuse and neglect investigated by child welfare services in Canada. This paper provides a detailed summary of the characteristics associated with intentionally false reports of child abuse and neglect within the context of parental separation. A multistage sampling design was used, first to select a representative sample of 51 child welfare service areas across Canada. Child maltreatment investigations conducted in the selected sites during the months of October-December 1998 were tracked, yielding a final sample of 7,672 child maltreatment investigations reported to child welfare authorities because of suspected child abuse or neglect. Consistent with other national studies of reported child maltreatment, CIS-98 data indicate that more than one-third of maltreatment investigations are unsubstantiated, but only 4% of all cases are considered to be

intentionally fabricated. Within the subsample of cases wherein a custody or access dispute has occurred, the rate of intentionally false allegations is higher: 12%. Results of this analysis show that neglect is the most common form of intentionally fabricated maltreatment, while anonymous reporters and noncustodial parents (usually fathers) most frequently make intentionally false reports. Of the intentionally false allegations of maltreatment tracked by the CIS-98, custodial parents (usually mothers) and children were least likely to fabricate reports of abuse or neglect. While the CIS-98 documents that the rate of intentionally false allegations is relatively low, these results raise important clinical and legal issues, which require further consideration.

Bow, J. N., Quinnell, F. A., Zaroff, M., & Assemany, A. (2002). Assessment of sexual abuse allegations in child custody cases. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 33(6), 566-575.

Family courts frequently rely on the expertise of mental health professionals to assess allegations of sexual abuse within the context of child custody evaluations. Such evaluations are complex and require knowledge of techniques used in sexual abuse and sexual offender evaluations, as well as knowledge of child custody practices. Preliminary findings from a national survey of 84 psychologists indicated that respondents tend to adhere to the child custody guidelines of the American Psychological Association. However, few practitioners followed formal models, protocols, or guidelines when evaluating alleged victims or alleged perpetrators of sexual abuse in conjunction with child custody disputes. Implications for professional practice are discussed, along with a proposed comprehensive model for assessing sexual abuse allegations in child custody cases.

Brown, T., Frederico, M., Hewitt, L., & Sheehan, R. (2001). The child abuse and divorce myth. *Child Abuse Review*, 10(2), 113-124.

When the authors of this article undertook a study into the way the Australian legal process managed child abuse allegations in custody and access disputes following partnership breakdown in de facto and legal marriages, they encountered what they came to think of as ‘the child abuse and divorce myth’. The myth centered around a belief that child abuse allegations made during or after partnership breakdown were weapons fashioned to gain advantage in the marital war.

Therefore, they were not real; therefore, they should not be taken seriously. Despite little previous research, these views were strongly held by both families and professionals. The article examines the myth, believed to be an international phenomenon, and shows, in detail, how the study's findings do not support it. In fact, the findings from this unique study contradict the myth in its totality and in its specific aspects. Thus, it is argued that the myth should be abandoned and a new knowledge base for professional intervention that recognizes the reality of this problem be adopted instead. As a result of the study, a new specialized intervention program for children involved in residence and contact disputes where child abuse was alleged is being trialed in the Family Court of Australia. Hopefully, the introduction of further intervention programmes based on the reality of child abuse in these circumstances rather than on the myth will follow.

Brown, T., Frederico, M., Hewitt, L., & Sheehan, R. (2000). Revealing the existence of child abuse in the context of marital breakdown and custody and access disputes. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, 24(6), 849-859.

Objective: Child abuse in the context of legal and de facto marital breakdown has received little attention internationally. Many believe it does not exist in this context and regard it as just a “gambit in the divorce wars.” Recently, however, family courts in a number of countries have become concerned over the management of child abuse allegations in custody and access cases, known more commonly now as residence and contact cases. This article presents a unique research study, which investigated how the Family Court of Australia dealt with such cases. The study, covering all forms of child abuse, sought to discover who were the families bringing these problems to family courts, what precisely the abuse was and how the courts dealt with it. The study reviewed court records of some 200 families where child abuse allegations had been made in custody and access disputes in jurisdictions in two states, observed court proceedings and interviewed court and related services’ staff. The findings showed that these cases had become a core component of the court’s workload without any public or professional awareness of this change, that the abuse was real, that it was severe and serious, and that the courts and child protection services did not provide appropriate services to the families. A new specialized intervention system was developed based on the research and it is now being trialed and evaluated.

The new intervention system contains features derived from the research findings that may be suitable internationally for implementation.

Cross, T. P., Martell, D., McDonald, E., & Ahl, M. (1999). The criminal justice system and child placement in child sexual abuse cases. *Child Maltreatment, 4*(1), 32-44.

This study examined the relationship between declining to prosecute child sexual abuse and child placement. All cases involving child sexual abuse charges referred to prosecutors in four jurisdictions across the country were tracked. A sample (N = 289) of the child victims and families from these cases were interviewed at the time of referral for prosecution and 8 to 9 months later, and data on life events (including child placement), maternal support, and child and family adjustment were gathered. In cases declined for prosecution, 41% of children were placed outside the home since the first interview, as compared to 19% of children in accepted cases ($p < .001$). A multivariate analysis demonstrated that children were significantly more likely to be placed outside the home when alleged abuse lasted more than 1 month, families were more disturbed, maternal support was less, and cases were declined for prosecution. Possible explanations for the relationship between prosecution and child placement are discussed as well as recommendations for practice and further research.

Kuehnle, K. (1998). Ethics and the forensic expert: A case study of child custody involving allegations of child sexual abuse. *Ethics and Behavior, 8*(1), 1-18.

Examines the involvement of allegations of child sexual abuse in a child custody case. Types of problems faced by psychologists; need for psychologists to possess advanced assessment skills; role of psychologists as independent evaluators.

Faller, K. C., & DeVoe, E. (1996). Allegations of sexual abuse in divorce. *Journal of Child Sexual Abuse*, 4(4), 1-25.

This study examines a clinical sample of 215 cases of allegations of sexual abuse in families also involved in divorce. Cases are categorized into situations in which: (1) disclosure of sexual abuse is followed by divorce (N = 31), (2) divorce is followed by disclosure of pre-existing sexual abuse (N = 54), (3) divorce is followed by sexual abuse (N = 58), (4) false allegations by adults (N = 31), (5) possible false allegations by adults (N = 14), (6) dynamics of sexual abuse not directly related to divorce (N = 27), and false allegations by children (N = 9). In addition, clinical substantiation (found in 72.6% of cases) and lack thereof are examined in terms of their relation to case characteristics assumed to be indicative of a true allegation: offender confession, offender conviction, medical/police evidence, other victims and witnesses, information from significant others, information from other professionals, and child interview data. Legal outcomes, including protection of the child, court substantiation, and any sanctions against the complaint, and their relationships to case characteristics, are described. The court substantiation rate is about half the clinic substantiation rate. Close to a fifth of parents raising concerns about sexual abuse experienced some form of sanction.

McIntosh, J. A., & Prinz, R. J. (1993). **The incidence of alleged sexual abuse in 603 family court cases.** *Law and Human Behavior*, 17(1), 95-101.

The conflict and animosity that sometimes accompanies child custody disputes can give rise to the propagation of allegations of child sexual abuse. To characterize the magnitude of the problem, the present study attempted to determine whether and to what extent child sexual abuse allegations predominate in family court litigation. The entire one-year caseload of a county family court docket was systematically reviewed and coded. Methodical evaluation of 603 family court files yielded base rates of pertinent allegations and other information profiling the cases. The findings did not support the contention that sexual abuse allegations are commonplace in child custody disputes. Sexual abuse allegations were made in 2% of cases in which custody or access was contested and in only 0.8% of the cases overall. Implications of the findings for future research were discussed.

McGraw, J. M., & Smith, H. (1992). Child sexual abuse allegations amidst divorce and custody proceedings: Refining the validation process. *Journal of Child Sexual Abuse, 1*(1), 49-62.

This study describes 18 cases of child sexual abuse allegations investigated by the Boulder County (Colorado) Sexual Abuse Team which revolved around divorce and custody disputes. Determining whether such allegations are reliable or fictitious presents a challenge to caseworkers who are apt to find themselves caught up in the highly charged atmosphere of divorce and custody proceedings. Initially, only 5.6% of the cases investigated were believed to be founded by the sexual abuse evaluation team. After applying the clinical process of validation used at the Kernpe Center in Denver, Colorado, the cases were subject to further review and categorized as follows: reliable accounts; recantations; unsubstantiated suspicions; insufficient information; fictitious reports by adults; and fictitious reports by children. Subsequent to applying this clinical process of validation, the number of cases categorized as founded increased to 44.4%. Application of a systematic process of validation by clinicians is suggested in the determination of whether reports are likely to be valid or fictitious. Tentative conclusions are drawn which acknowledge that the atmosphere surrounding divorce/ custody proceedings can affect objectivity by clinicians and which suggest adherence to a systematic clinical process of validation.

Faller, K. C. (1991). Possible explanations for child sexual abuse allegations in divorce. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry, 61*(1), 86-91.

Based on a clinical sample of 136 cases, four classes of child sexual abuse cases in divorce are proposed: divorce precipitated by discovery of sexual abuse; long-standing sexual victimization revealed after marital breakup; sexual abuse precipitated by marital dissolution; and false allegations made during or after divorce. Implications for clinical practice are discussed.

Thoennes, N., & Tjaden, P. G. (1990). The extent, nature, and validity of sexual abuse allegations in custody/visitation disputes. *Child Abuse & Neglect, 14*(2), 151-63.

Using information from mail and telephone surveys and personal interviews with legal and mental health professionals who deal with child abuse cases, and empirical data from 12 domestic relations courts throughout the United States, the study concludes that only a small proportion of

contested custody and visitation cases involve sexual abuse allegations. Records maintained by family court workers place the figure at less than 2%. A sample of 169 cases for which data were gathered from court counselors, family court, and CPS agency files also found that accusations were brought by mothers (67%) and fathers (28%) and third parties (11%). Fathers were accused in 51% of all cases, but allegations were also made against mothers, mothers' new partners, and extended family members. In the 129 cases for which a determination of the validity of the allegation was available, 50% were found to involve abuse, 33% were found to involve no abuse, and 17% resulted in an indeterminate ruling. Four factors were significantly associated with the perceived validity of the abuse report: age of the victim, frequency of the alleged abuse, prior abuse/neglect reports, and the amount of time elapsing between filing for divorce and the emergence of the allegation.

Corwin, D. L., Berlinger, L., Goodman, G., Goodwin, J., & White, S. (1987). Child sexual abuse and custody disputes: No easy answers. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 2(1), 91-105.

This article alerts professionals to the emergence of oversimplified approaches to the complex problem of alleged child sexual abuse in the context of custody disputes. We argue that reliance on such methods is likely to result in misdiagnosis and failure to protect children who are both sexually abused and caught in custody battles. We specifically take issue with Green's (1986) recent formulation for distinguishing between true and false accusations of incest in child custody disputes because that formulation is based on an inadequate data base, biased sample, and unsupported conclusions. In addition, we discuss the limits of clinical impression, the difference between unfounded or unsubstantiated and false accusations of abuse, and the high prevalence of actual child sexual abuse in the setting of marital dissolution.

Dillon, K. M. (1987). False sexual abuse allegation: causes and concerns. *Social Work*, 32(6), 540-41.

The article examines a number of generalizations about child sexual abuse. Because of the zeal to protect children from sexual abuse and because a number of generalizations have evolved about sexual abuse, society has paid less attention to the rights of those accused of sexual abuse. Certain

physical and behavioral signs generally associated with sexual abuse serve as guideposts in making clinical decisions about the likelihood that sexual abuse has occurred. A problem arises, however, when guideposts become generalizations that are presumed to indicate sexual abuse in all cases in which they appear. Those who examine children for sexual abuse should be aware of the systematic nature of their conclusions. Not only is the examiner making a statement about a child and the child's welfare, the examiner also is making a judgment about the guilt or innocence of another human being regarding an action considered a serious criminal and moral offense. Given that weighty responsibility, examiners must be well qualified and exercise extreme caution in making allegations of sexual abuse, especially in cases in which the child is younger than 5 years old; the evidence is strictly behavioral or the parents of the child are in a custody battle.

Bresee, P., Stearns, G. B., Bess, B. H., & Packer, L. S. (1986). Allegations of child sexual abuse in child custody disputes: A therapeutic assessment model. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 56(4), 560-569.

Guidelines are set forth for judges and others who must make decisions in custody disputes that include allegations of child sexual abuse. The focus is on the protection of the child and the model highlights the role of mental health professionals, prescribing separate therapists for child and parent where possible. Allegations of sexual abuse are seen as an indicator of emotional risk for the child, even in cases where the allegations are untrue.